

# READING WRITING IN THE DISCIPLINES

## Identifying Evidence from Multiple Sources Video Transcript

**Student:**

It says he brought an end to the violence of the French Revolution.

**Student:**

But then he started more violence by taking over other people.

**Jesse Gore:**

For our lesson today, I really wanted students to be able to determine if Napoleon was a hero or a tyrant.

We have talked about Napoleon a few times so far this year, so this is going to be a way for us to wrap up our discussion of Napoleon and really figure out if we think he was a heroic man or if he was a tyrannical man.

The biggest goal is to really see students learn how to prove their answers and to show evidence for their reasons or for their debates.

Our objective for today, as you can see, is that you will be able to use primary and secondary sources to interpret various historical perspectives. When we hear the word "hero," we're going to write those characteristics down in blue. With our red pen, characteristics of the word "tyrant." Go ahead and write as many characteristics of both of those words as you can.

We really focus on vocab in social studies, and we really focus on ways to remember those words.

All right, so at this point, focus our attention over to the wall here, and I'm going to write down the characteristics that you come up with to describe the word "hero" and then the word "tyrant." So let's start with hero. Please raise your hand. Abby.

**Abby:**

Fearless.

**Gore:**

Fearless, great. Jeffrey.

**Jeffrey:**

Legend.

**Gore:**

A legend. Let's get one more. Sophia.

**Sophia:**

Like, a sacrifice, or sacrificial.

**Gore:**

Okay, so he's willing to sacrifice himself. That's great. Those are some good descriptions of what we believe a hero would be. Who has some words for tyrant? Amari.

**Amari:**

Villain.

**Gore:**

A villain.

A lot of times, students come to me in seventh grade and they think they have to learn the entire definition word for word or they're not going to get it correct.

Jericho.

**Jericho:**

Dictator.

**Gore:**

Okay, we might see him as a dictator. That's a good word that we've talked about this year.

What we've really learned to do in my class is pick out key phrases or even synonyms within the definition. Reed.

**Reed:**

Absolute.

**Gore:**

Absolute, we've talked about that absolute power, where someone has complete control of something. All right, so we're going to leave this list up here for you to reference throughout the class period. Now what I'd like you to please do is to annotate your poster. Before we actually discuss if Napoleon is a hero or a tyrant, we're going to try to look for evidence that will help us answer that question.

By now, after a quarter and a half, they know how to annotate, they know how to prove their work, they know that it's never acceptable to say yes or no, but they have to explain why.

**Student:**

If he crowns himself emperor, that would be kind of bad guy, because he's crowning himself.

**Gore:**

Our objective was to use primary and secondary sources to be able to defend our work. Literacy's not always just reading an article or reading a story; it's being able to read the facts within charts, within graphs, within images.

**Steven:**

We were able to look at all the different pieces of evidence and make the decision whether or not we thought that he was a hero or a tyrant. There was a lot of evidence to look through, so that was fun.

**Gore:**

I think group work is the best type of learning because a lot of times, students learn more from their peers than they do from the teacher, and they're not afraid to get a wrong answer because they know that everyone's learning.

**Student:**

I think the significance of the wheel, of spinning it, saying, "This is what we're gonna do next."

**Student:**

Right here, this is a good thing, that he brought an end to the violence of the French Revolution.

**Jericho:**

Right, that's a good one.

**Student:**

This proved that he's not really that good because it says right here, "Napoleon's victims."

**Jericho:**

Right, that's...

**Gore:**

Students were able to look at those primary and secondary sources and really determine if that evidence pointed towards him being heroic or tyrannical.

So let's look at image one. Is there anyone who's willing to come up to the board and annotate what you put onto your actual paper? Jericho.

I like to have student interaction with the Smart Board because they really enjoy using it, but at the same time, the main motive for that is then to be able to model for the other students best practices for proving their work.

**Jericho:**

You can see, like, on his uniform, it looks like there's a wheel showing maybe, like, he's spinning it to see who he's gonna take over next, who he's gonna dictate over, like, his new land.

**Gore:**

Is there anything in this one that you maybe thought was heroic? Sophia?

**Sophia:**

The Triumph of the Year?

**Gore:**

The Triumph of the Year. That sounds very heroic. However, how can that title also be the opposite? How can it be tyrannical? Steven?

**Steven:**

If you, like, triumph over another person or another country, that means that he's just getting more land and stuff.

**Gore:**

I really like open-ended things because it allows them to, again, prove their answer. There's usually not a right or wrong answer if you are able to compose the question the right way.

**Student:**

I think that that could be underlined and read also because if he was the emperor, that means that he had, like, absolute power, and that's what we wrote up there.

**Gore:**

Good, so we can see that some things can be interpreted in both ways. That word "emperor" earlier we put down, very similar qualities to an emperor under "tyrant." We didn't write that specific word, but things like "pharaoh, dictator, absolute" are very similar to that. Now, what fact from your other resources contradicts this one? We need to make sure we can prove our answer with some evidence, so what evidence can we use? Colby?

**Colby:**

It says, "Crowned himself emperor in 1804."

**Gore:**

Good, so that's a great detail to pick out. What I would like you to now do is I'd like you to talk with your group and I want you to come up with your answer: is Napoleon a hero or a tyrant? And make sure you use evidence to prove your answer.

**Student:**

And then as time went on, he got so power hungry.

**Student:**

He ended the violence in the French Revolution.

**Steven:**

But then he started more violence.

**Jericho:**

I mean, there's always going to be some faults, and they're just starting to realize it here.

**Student:**

But they said...

**Gore:**

I was able to allow me to assess them in a formative way to really see that each student was participating, so it was a way for every student to really share his or her opinion on the answer.

We're going to ask the question again. I'd like you to vote. Do you believe that Napoleon was a hero? Raise your hand. He is a hero. Okay, got two people for that. What about tyrant? Five people. So I'm missing about 20 people, so I'm guessing we think that he is in between. Raise your hand if you think he's in between. Who can tell us why you say in the middle? Izzy?

**Izzy:**

He brought an end to the violence of the French Revolution, but then he crowned himself emperor.

**Steven:**

Like, he may have negotiated the peace, but to where the French still had most of the power.

**Gore:**

So he's doing these things that might be seen as heroic, but we want to question his motives. What I'd like you to do independently to wrap up today is to answer our two closure questions.

When they're able to prove their work with evidence, it really helps to confirm an idea. It really helps to tell us that this actually is good evidence to prove that maybe he was a hero or maybe he was a tyrant.

Raise your hand if you thought we met our objective today. Jericho?

**Jericho:**

I think we met the objective because we got to interact with the text and kind of discuss what we thought, and I think when we hear other people and what they think about it, we have new ideas, and it kind of helps us discuss and help us understand.