

## Comparing Student Persuasive Pieces: What Students Thought About the Soccer Pieces

*Editor's note: These responses are reproduced exactly as the students wrote them, including mechanical and grammatical errors.*

### Student Response 1

I think that the persuasive essay titled Getting lined soccer field with goals was more effective than the one called Soccer field.

The first essay began with a description. The 2<sup>nd</sup> essay started with diolauge. I think that diolauge is more effective because it seems more realistic. You seem to hear specifically what happens, what kids say and how they react. The other essay just says that it stalls the game for a while. The 2<sup>nd</sup> entry specifically says that it stalls the game, kids quit, and that it makes them argue a lot.

Then, the first essay lists what it wants to happen to the soccer field. The 2<sup>nd</sup> essay says 1 thing to fix, then says why, how, and, in some cases, when. Then it goes on to another thing. With the first essay we read the list and feel overwhelmed at all the stuff to fix. With the 2<sup>nd</sup> one we didn't feel that way.

Then, when the 1<sup>st</sup> essay explained the solutions to the problems it did so in a very genral way. For instance, for the solution to the money problem it said: fundraisers. It didn't say what it would be or how it would help. The 2<sup>nd</sup> essay said that the fundraiser might be a play or a sale and what the cost might be.

Then, at the end the 1<sup>st</sup> essay says to contact Dartmouth soccer for answers to questions I was wondering why Dartmouth soccer would be involved anyway! It's also kind of like saying: "Go away, I'm done explaining! Go talk to them if you have questions!" The 2<sup>nd</sup> essay doesn't just cut you of like that.

Then, the last sentence in the 1<sup>st</sup> essay kids will have more fun at recess. It doesn't say why or how they would have more fun. In the 2<sup>nd</sup> essay they said that kids would have more fun because of blah blah blah, not just kids will have more fun.

## **Student Response 2**

I think that the “Getting Lined Soccer Field with Goals” story is much more persuasive than the other story. I think it is more persuasive than the “Soccer Field” story because it just basically gives the reader a list and that is less convincing than sort of blending in what you want changed and that is how the other piece is like. With a list the things that you want changed stand out and makes it look like an bigger list and the other one doesn’t do that.

The first piece only gives one good reason to do what that person asked and the second one have more reasons and has different situations why the kids don’t like the soccer field the way it is. The first piece only has one situation which makes you wonder why we need all of these other things on that list. The second piece also shows what it would like if the changes were made, the second piece doesn’t show what the future would be like and it has all of it’s problems at the end of the piece and they’re all in one place, not spread out which makes it seem like there are a lot of problems.